```
Delivered-To: rick.lumpkin@noaa.gov
Received: by 10.182.237.137 with SMTP id vc9csp48370obc;
        Tue, 16 Oct 2012 09:19:36 -0700 (PDT)
Received: by 10.68.195.9 with SMTP id ia9mr38751779pbc.74.1350404376496;
        Tue, 16 Oct 2012 09:19:36 -0700 (PDT)
Return-Path: <joel.levy@noaa.gov>
Received: from psmtp.com (na3sys009amx222.postini.com [74.125.149.62])
        by mx.google.com with SMTP id
f9si8572690paz.0.2012.10.16.09.19.35
        (version=TLSv1/SSLv3 cipher=OTHER);
        Tue, 16 Oct 2012 09:19:36 -0700 (PDT)
Received-SPF: neutral (google.com: 74.125.149.244 is neither permitted nor
denied by best guess record for domain of joel.levy@noaa.gov)
client-ip=74.125.149.244;
Authentication-Results: mx.google.com; spf=neutral (google.com:
74.125.149.244 is neither permitted nor denied by best guess record for
domain of joel.levy@noaa.gov) smtp.mail=joel.levy@noaa.gov
Received: from na3sys009aog118.obsmtp.com ([74.125.149.244]) (using
TLSv1) by na3sys009amx222.postini.com ([74.125.148.10]) with SMTP;
     Tue, 16 Oct 2012 16:19:36 GMT
Received: from mail-oa0-f51.google.com ([209.85.219.51]) (using TLSv1) by
na3sys009aob118.postini.com ([74.125.148.12]) with SMTP
     ID DSNKUH2JF4xQrMZ2dHDRQrLQDCqEtl612UJU@postini.com; Tue, 16 Oct
2012 09:19:36 PDT
Received: by mail-oa0-f51.google.com with SMTP id n12so6220984oag.38
        for <rick.lumpkin@noaa.gov>; Tue, 16 Oct 2012 09:19:35 -0700 (PDT)
X-Google-DKIM-Signature: v=1; a=rsa-sha256; c=relaxed/relaxed;
        d=google.com; s=20120113;
        h=mime-version:from:date:message-id:subject:to:content-type
         :x-qm-message-state;
        bh=24MRL101ZBIiH4uGY8PXfjDFFVskYc08x9MoPjittsc=;
b=isVithxCa2lzLQcPcNf9no9pdkvKK+DJRd6cUj4JAHc2A8qjm0zUzpmdITlcjoqU9W
fQScpdQzI+Zsyey9LrtPWtalr5eJWnFZ6YTTMUS0d0RkHSZFWCkYelOXEOVp1GQNe1MA
OBEL1hxn/NOTfcD071Vs08yhzHjkYS32Tc9Wvr48kE3dMqxfVQ701NDN2k0lIzYL16xL
s4JeiGRXNMq7yvHP3WS9kWO9NczzKkX+QXWDhaKdFqte4zcE6YWrMVXwLYNsz3SENk7s
O5Rpnj2mUv8KwRikbM+jmGn1flbmUCeLVHIr6Qs5jUCSWXXvEQUknO7iSqtzv5SJeqxW
         Z9NA==
Received: by 10.60.170.43 with SMTP id
aj11mr13266641oec.71.1350404374946;
Tue, 16 Oct 2012 09:19:34 -0700 (PDT)
MIME-Version: 1.0
Received: by 10.182.214.201 with HTTP; Tue, 16 Oct 2012 09:19:04 -0700 (PDT)
From: Joel Levy <joel.levy@noaa.gov>
Date: Tue, 16 Oct 2012 12:19:04 -0400
Message-ID:
<CABEXvKZEO=P5Py3t6S7FkoFVCHDDxFF6N6OTOBRmGYaMVq O Q@mail.qmail.com>
Subject: Richard Mannix's initial summary for the State Department
```

To: Candyce Clark <candyce.clark@noaa.gov>, Rick Lumpkin

<rick.lumpkin@noaa.gov>

Content-Type: multipart/alternative; boundary=bcaec54b4a1c1261dd04cc2f854b

X-Gm-Message-State:

ALoCoQlbXQTzCv91k5h5gz7Ex/zR5vsXpz7DvxnhC+Ydf28ZrmHzI916UifPEKQRc2PceODBHJX2

X-pstn-neptune: 0/0/0.00/0

X-pstn-levels: (S:99.90000/99.90000 CV:99.9000 FC:95.5390 LC:93.6803

R:95.9108 P:95.9108 M:97.0282 C:98.6951 )

X-pstn-dkim: 0 skipped:not-enabled

X-pstn-settings: 1 (0.1500:0.0015) cv GT3 gt2 gt1 r p m c
X-pstn-addresses: from <joel.levy@noaa.gov> [db-null]
X-pstn-nxpr: disp=neutral, envrcpt=rick.lumpkin@noaa.gov
X-pstn-nxp: bodyHash=741efe49b7b993e364e6ed0f0af7a741ead846f1,
headerHash=09f9531db69c88f6dd9b7f6625e5bd0170b4efe6, keyName=4,
rcptHash=9ed437bb2697b93b6e27fc1698c05229f9e0ed45,
sourceip=74.125.149.244, version=1

--bcaec54b4a1c1261dd04cc2f854b

Content-Type: text/plain; charset=ISO-8859-1

Here it is. Sent yesterday at 5:55PM.

-- Joel

-----

Joel M. Levy, Ph.D.

Program Manager

Climate Observation Division (R/CP4)

NOAA Climate Program Office

1100 Wayne Avenue, Suite 1202

Silver Spring, MD 20910

Tel: 301-427-2462 Fax: 301-427-0033

Email: Joel.Levy@noaa.gov

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Marian Westley <marian.westley@noaa.gov>

Date: Tue, Oct 16, 2012 at 9:31 AM

Subject: Re: Rogue geoengineering ... bad press for NOAA

To: Joel Levy <joel.levy@noaa.gov>, Richard Mannix

<richard.mannix@noaa.gov>

Cc: Derek Parks <derek.parks@noaa.gov>, Danielle Tillman <</pre>

danielle.tillman@noaa.gov>, Patricia Hathaway

<patricia.hathaway@noaa.gov>,

Dian Seidel <dian.seidel@noaa.gov>, Philip Hoffman

<philip.hoffman@noaa.gov>

Joel,

I am going to paste a message that Richard Mannix, from NOAA's Office of General Counsel, sent to our colleagues in the State Department last night—he has made progress tracking this issue down so I suggest you join forces. Thanks to you and all in OCO for working so hard on this.

## Marian

From: Richard Mannix <richard.mannix@noaa.gov>

Date: Mon, Oct 15, 2012 at 5:55 PM

Subject: Iron dumping

To: "Bland, J. Nathan" <BlandJN@state.gov> Cc: Allison Reed <Allison.Reed@noaa.gov>

Nathan -- Allison and I have been sharing the results of our parallel investigations. NOAA's Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory tells me that these were "surface drifters" which send real time data on currents, salinity, temperature, etc. back through Service Argos (hence "Argos Drifters" as opposed to Argo floats). They are managed by NOAA's Atlantic Oceanographic and Meteorological Laboratory in Miami (which obviously functions beyond the Atlantic). The lab folks, at first, said that it was probably a mere coincidence that the rogue "research vessel" that dumped the iron had also volunteered to deploy these drifters in to fill a gap

to cover an ocean space where data were needed. But as we thought about it, we realized that there could have been something more nefarious afoot. These drifters would have enabled Mr. Geoge to monitor in real time the progress of his dumping effort using data from satellites. The data they produce are readily available to anyone and the "Guardian" article says that "unidentified scientists" had been monitoring the results of this "biggest ever geoengineering experiment with equipment loaned from . . . NASA and NOAA." This could well have been the NOAA "equipment" that he claims assisted his OF effort. Clearly, his purpose and NOAA's purpose in deploying this equipment were completely different. I have a call in to the manager of the AOML program in Miami.

On Tue, Oct 16, 2012 at 9:07 AM, Joel Levy <joel.levy@noaa.gov> wrote:

- > We're working this hard at the ocean obs system trying to find out what, > if any, ocean obs might have been co-opted leading to over-statements about
- > NOAA involvement. Should know more by early afternoon. Rumors re Argo > deployments by this group are apparently not correct.
- > I will propose here at OCO that once we have got the facts straight we > summarize it concisely for interested parties at NOAA. I will be happy to
- > pass on to you what we learn.

```
> -- Joel
>
>
>
--bcaec54b4a1c1261dd04cc2f854b
Content-Type: text/html; charset=ISO-8859-1
Content-Transfer-Encoding: quoted-printable
Here it is.=A0 Sent yesterday at 5:55PM.=A0 <br>-- Joel<br
clear=3D"all=
"><font style=3D"color:rgb(51,51,51)"><font
face=3D"tahoma, sans-serif"><br>=
Ph.D.<br/>br>Progra=
m Manager<br>
Climate Observation Division (R/CP4) <br/>
Shr>NOAA Climate Program
Office<br/>br>1100=
Wayne Avenue, Suite 1202<br>Silver Spring, MD 20910<br/>br>Tel:
301-427-2462 < b =
r>Fax: 301-427-0033<br>Email: <a href=3D"mailto:Joel.Levy@noaa.gov"
=3D" blank">Joel.Levy@noaa.gov</a><br>
</font></font><br>
<br><div class=3D"gmail quote">----- Forwarded message
br>From: <b class=3D"qmail sendername">Marian Westley</b> <span</pre>
dir=3D"ltr"=
><<a
href=3D"mailto:marian.westley@noaa.gov">marian.westley@noaa.gov</a>=
&qt;</span><br>
Date: Tue, Oct 16, 2012 at 9:31 AM<br/>br>Subject: Re: Rogue geoengineering
bad press for NOAA<br/>br>To: Joel Levy &lt;<a
href=3D"mailto:joel.levy@noaa.g=
ov">joel.levy@noaa.gov</a>&gt;, Richard Mannix &lt;<a
href=3D"mailto:richar=
d.mannix@noaa.gov">richard.mannix@noaa.gov</a>&gt;<br>
Cc: Derek Parks <<a</pre>
href=3D"mailto:derek.parks@noaa.gov">derek.parks@noa=
a.gov</a>&gt;, Danielle Tillman &lt;<a
href=3D"mailto:danielle.tillman@noaa=
.gov">danielle.tillman@noaa.gov</a>&gt;, Patricia Hathaway &lt;<a
ailto:patricia.hathaway@noaa.gov">patricia.hathaway@noaa.gov</a>&gt;,
Dian =
```

```
Seidel < <a
href=3D"mailto:dian.seidel@noaa.gov">dian.seidel@noaa.gov</a>=
>, Philip Hoffman <<a
href=3D"mailto:philip.hoffman@noaa.gov">philip.=
hoffman@noaa.gov</a>&qt;<br>
<br>>Joel,<div><div><div>I am going to paste a message that
Richard=
Mannix, from NOAA's Office of General Counsel, sent to our colleagues
in the State Department last night--he has made progress tracking this issu-
e down so I suggest you join forces. Thanks to you and all in OCO for worki=
ng so hard on this.</div>
<div><br></div><div>Marian</div><div><br></div><div><span
style=3D"color:rg=
b(34,34,34); font-size:13px; font-family:arial, sans-serif">From:=A0</spa
n > < b =
class=3D"gmail sendername"
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font=
-family:arial, sans-serif">Richard Mannix</b><span
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,=
34); font-size:13px; font-family:arial, sans-serif">=A0</span><span
dir=3D"ltr=
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-ser
>< <a href=3D"mailto:richard.mannix@noaa.gov"
style=3D"color:rgb(17,85,20=
4) " target=3D" blank">richard.mannix@noaa.gov</a>&gt;</span><br
style=3D"co=
lor:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-serif">
<span
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-se=
rif">Date: Mon, Oct 15, 2012 at 5:55 PM</span><br
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,=
34); font-size:13px; font-family:arial, sans-serif">
<span
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-se=
rif">Subject: Iron dumping</span><br
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size=
:13px; font-family:arial, sans-serif">
<span
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-se=
rif">To: "Bland, J. Nathan" <</span><a</pre>
href=3D"mailto:BlandJN@=
style=3D"color:rgb(17,85,204); font-size:13px; font-family:arial,s=
ans-serif" target=3D" blank">BlandJN@state.gov</a><span</pre>
```

```
style=3D"color:rqb(=
34,34,34); font-size:13px; font-family:arial,sans-serif">&qt;</span><br
=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-serif">
<span
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-se=
rif">Cc: Allison Reed <</span><a
href=3D"mailto:Allison.Reed@noaa.gov" s=
tyle=3D"color:rqb(17,85,204);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-ser
if" t=
arget=3D" blank">Allison.Reed@noaa.gov</a><span</pre>
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34=
); font-size:13px; font-family:arial, sans-serif">&qt;</span><br
style=3D"colo=
r:rqb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-serif">
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,sans-ser
i=
f"><br
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34); font-size:13px; font-family:arial, sans-s=
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13px;font-family:arial,s=
ans-serif">Nathan -- Allison and I have been sharing the results of our
allel investigations.=A0=A0NOAA's=A0</span><span
style=3D"color:rgb(34,=
34,34); font-size:13px; font-family:arial, sans-serif">Pacific Marine
Environm=
ental Laboratory tells me that these were " surface drifters "
whic=
h send real time data on currents, salinity, temperature, etc. back through=
Service Argos (hence " Argos Drifters" as opposed to Argo
floats) =
. =AOThey are managed by NOAA's Atlantic Oceanographic and
Meteorologic=
al Laboratory in Miami (which obviously functions beyond the Atlantic).
=A0=
The lab folks, at first, said that it was probably a mere coincidence that
the rogue " research vessel" that dumped the iron had also
volunte=
ered to deploy these drifters in to fill a gap -- to cover an ocean space
here data were needed. =AOBut as we thought about it, we realized that ther=
e could have been something more nefarious afoot. =AOThese drifters would
ave enabled Mr. Geoge</span><span
style=3D"color:rgb(34,34,34);font-size:13=
```

px; font-family: arial, sans-serif">=A0to monitor in real time the progress of=his dumping effort using data from satellites. The data they produce are eadily available to anyone and the<i>Guardian</i>=A0article says that ;unidentified scientists & quot; had been monitoring the results of this t; biggest ever geoengineering experiment with equipment loaned from . . ASA and NOAA. " = AO This could well have been the NOAA "equipment&q= uot; that he claims assisted his OF effort. =AOClearly, his purpose and A's purpose in deploying this equipment were completely different. =A0I=<div><br></div><div><div><br><div class=3D"gmail guote">On Tue, Oct 16, 2012= at 9:07 AM, Joel Levy <span dir=3D"ltr">&lt;<a href=3D"mailto:joel.levy@no= aa.gov" target=3D" blank">joel.levy@noaa.gov</a>&gt;</span> wrote:<br> <blockquote class=3D"qmail quote" style=3D"margin:0 0 0</pre> .8ex;border-left:1p= x #ccc solid; padding-left:1ex">We' re working this hard at the ocean system trying to find out what, if any, ocean obs might have been co-opted= leading to over-statements about NOAA involvement. = AOShould know more early afternoon. =AORumors re Argo deployments by this group are apparently= not correct. =A0<div> <div><br></div><div>I will propose here at OCO that once we have got the fa= cts straight we summarize it concisely for interested parties at NOAA. I 11 be happy to pass on to you what we learn.</div><span><font color=3D"#888= 888"><div> <br></div></font></span><div><span><font color=3D"#888888"> -- Joel</font></span><div><br clear=3D"all"> <font style=3D"color:rgb(51,51,51)"><font face=3D"tahoma, sans-serif"><br>=

= A0 < / font > < / div > < / div

--bcaec54b4a1c1261dd04cc2f854b--