



*Journal of Fish Biology* (2013) **83**, 847–864 doi:10.1111/jfb.12124, available online at wileyonlinelibrary.com

# Vulnerability of artisanal fisheries to climate change in the Venice Lagoon<sup>a</sup>

# F. Pranovi\*, A. Caccin, P. Franzoi, S. Malavasi, M. Zucchetta and P. Torricelli

Department of Environmental Sciences, Informatics and Statistics, DAIS, University Ca' Foscari, Venice, Castello 2737b, 30122, Venice, Italy

Within the context of global warming, the western coast of the northern Adriatic Sea can be regarded as an extremely vulnerable area. Owing to the local geographic features, this area has been described as the Venetian lacuna, where Mediterranean Sea climatic conditions are replaced by Atlantic Ocean ones, supporting the presence of glacial relicts, such as sprat Sprattus sprattus, flounder *Platichthys flesus* and brown shrimp *Crangon crangon*. Nektonic assemblage therefore represents a good candidate in terms of an early proxy for thermal regime alterations. It represents a dynamic component of the lagoon ecosystem, changing in space and time, actively moving through the entire system, and dynamically exchanging with the open sea. Here, the first signals of the change have been already detected, such as the presence of alien thermophilic species. Within this context, since the beginning of the century, sampling of the nektonic assemblage has been carried out, integrating them with landings data from the fish market. Vulnerabilities to thermal regime changes have been tested by (1) categorizing species according to the mean distribution area in terms of latitudinal range (over  $45^{\circ}$ ,  $30^{\circ}-45^{\circ}$  and below  $30^{\circ}$ ), and (2) analysing both spatial and temporal variations within fishing grounds. Results indicated a high potential vulnerability of the artisanal fishery to climate change, as the commercial catch is entirely composed of species from cold (>45° N) and temperate (between 45° and 30° N) latitudes. At present no alien thermophilic species have been recorded within the lagoon, which is possibly a sign of good resilience of the assemblage. Finally, abundance of species from cold latitudes has decreased during the past decade. All of this has been discussed in the context of the mean annual temperature trend © 2013 The Authors

Journal of Fish Biology © 2013 The Fisheries Society of the British Isles

Key words: global changes; landings; northern Adriatic Sea; small-scale fishery; temperature; time series.

# **INTRODUCTION**

Climate change is one of the major drivers affecting structure and function of both terrestrial and marine ecosystems, and effects are expected to grow in the near future (Cramer *et al.*, 2001; Hughes *et al.*, 2003; Parmesan & Yohe, 2003; Rosenzweig *et al.*, 2008; Drinkwater *et al.*, 2010). Mediated mainly by modifications

\*Author to whom correspondence should be addressed. Tel.: +39 0412347735; email: fpranovi@unive.it

<sup>a</sup>This paper was presented at the 6th World Fisherie s Congress, Edinburgh, in 2012 (sponsored by the FSBI). As a result its content may not fall within the normal scope of the *Journal of Fish Biology*.

847

in thermal regimes, ocean currents and coastal upwelling, several changes in marine ecosystems have been described already, such as shifting in geographic distributions towards higher latitudes (Parmesan, 2006; Hiddink & Hofstede, 2008; Ben Rais Lasram *et al.*, 2010), increasing extinction rates (Thomas *et al.*, 2001; Cheung *et al.*, 2009) and reorganization of local communities in relation to substitutions of native species by exotic thermophilic ones (Mills *et al.*, 2004; Ben Rais Lasram & Mouillot, 2009). Even if the real effects of these changes on a global scale are currently under discussion, on a local scale they are producing significant change in terms of structure and function of marine ecosystems (Drinkwater *et al.*, 2010.

Among other human activities, global changes are expected to directly affect fisheries worldwide (Cheung *et al.*, 2009; Brander, 2010). Changes both in productivity and distribution areas, decreasing of target species abundance, species replacement, direct effects of warming on growth, survival, migratory behaviour and reproductive rates of many species are expected to greatly affect marine resources and their exploitation, with social and economic costs for human populations (Brander, 2007).

In relation to the exposure to global changes, some areas and habitats, such as semi-enclosed basins and polar areas, where the range shifts are physically constrained, could be more vulnerable than others. For the Mediterranean Sea basin, the potential vulnerability exists where this inland sea acts as a cul de sac for endemic species as highlighted by Ben Rais Lasram *et al.* (2010). Within this context, the western part of the northern Adriatic Sea shares similar geography. This area, together with the Gulf of Lion, represents one of the coldest zones of the Mediterranean Sea basin, and has been described as the Venetian lacuna. This is defined as an interruption of the Mediterranean Sea due to the presence of Atlantic climate conditions. Its terrestrial composition was first described by Marcello (1960), noting the absence of typical Mediterranean plants. Successively, an effect on marine environment was recognized, namely to intertidal assemblages (Sacchi, 1978), and the geographical limit of the lacuna was found to coincide with the winter season isotherm of  $7^{\circ}$  C.

The Venice Lagoon, located in the middle of the lacuna, could be especially vulnerable in this context, being a semi-enclosed area, inside two other basins with the same peculiar features (Adriatic and Mediterranean Seas). Owing to the millenary coexistence, local populations are strongly linked with the lagoon environment, with fishing activities deeply rooted in local traditions. At present, the exploitation of marine renewable resources occurs as two different activities: an artisanal fishery (Granzotto *et al.*, 2001; Libralato *et al.*, 2004) and recent mechanical clam harvesting, developed about three decades ago after the introduction of Manila clam *Ruditapes philippinarum* in the lagoon in 1983 (Pranovi *et al.*, 2006).

Being multigear and multitarget, the artisanal fishery in the lagoon can be defined as a small-scale fishery according to the current European Commission classification (*i.e.* fishery performed by boats <12 m overall length equipped with passive gear). Conversely, the clam harvest, being a single-target activity carried out with mechanized gear that disturbs the ecosystem (Pranovi *et al.*, 2004), can be defined as a semiindustrial fishing activity. During recent decades, the interaction between the two activities presented a source of conflicts, with negative direct impacts of the mechanical harvesting on the artisanal fishery (Pranovi *et al.*, 2003; Granzotto *et al.*, 2004). For the above reasons, the vulnerability of the artisanal fishery in the Venice Lagoon represents an interesting issue to be analysed in terms of relevance for its social, economic and ecological implications (AdriaMed, 2005; Battaglia *et al.*, 2010). The aims of this paper are: to offer a description of the present situation of the artisanal fishery in the Venice Lagoon; to analyse landings time series for detecting modifications (e.g. regime shifts), potentially related to climate changes; to assess the potential vulnerability of the renewable resources exploitation to climate changes in the Venice Lagoon.

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

# SAMPLING ACTIVITIES

Sampling was conducted over two periods from 2001 to 2003 and 2009 to 2010. Fyke nets were deployed and the catches were examined monthly (mean  $\pm$  s.e. =  $22.2 \pm 2.4$  traps per month) when fishermen emptied them. Four sampling areas, located in the three main basins, ensured data represented the primary lagoon fishing grounds (Fig. 1). Collected specimens were classified and counted, and for each taxon the total wet mass was recorded directly onboard (only cases of dubious attribution were transferred to the laboratory as samples).

Fishermen visited the traps relative to the expected catch amount (which varied seasonally), thus optimizing their effort. Because of this, the amount of catch observed during sampling may have represented the outcome of one or more days' fishing depending on the time of year. Therefore, in order to obtain homogenous data, a standardization in terms of catch (g) per trap per day was performed, taking into the account the number of days since the previous visit by the fishermen. Once the composition of the catches was characterized, the complete time series of landings for targeted species, from 1945 to 2011, was reconstructed with data from the fish market of Chioggia, which represents the most important market in the area. As interests were to analyse the global trend of each exploited species, no correction was applied given that species were simultaneously targeted by different fishing gears in the lagoon and at sea.



FIG. 1. Sampling areas in Venice Lagoon (N, northern basin; C1 and C2, central basin; S, southern basin).

# DATA ANALYSIS

Species were grouped as target (species targeted by the fishing activity), incidental (species of commercial interest but not representing the main target) and discard (species with no commercial value). A further classification was carried out according to ecological guilds (Malavasi *et al.*, 2004; Franco *et al.*, 2006), *i.e.* estuarine (all the life cycle in the lagoon), marine migrant (regularly migrating between lagoon and sea environment), marine stragglers (occasionally present in the lagoon, preferring marine salinity areas), anadromous and catadromous species (regularly migrating between freshwater and marine areas and *vice versa*, passing through the lagoon) and finally freshwater species (typical of freshwater environment and occasionally recorded in the brackish waters).

In order to assess the thermal affinity of each sampled species, distributional data for the Northern hemisphere were obtained from the online database of the Ocean Biogeographic Information System (OBIS; www.iobis.org) within the Global Biodiversity Information Facility (GBIF: http://data.gbif.org/). Arbitrary latitudinal thresholds were set at  $30^{\circ}$  N (southern limit of the Mediterranean Sea basin) and  $45^{\circ}$  N (northern limit of the basin, excluding the northernmost parts of the Adriatic and Black Seas), defining a northern cold zone (>45 $^{\circ}$  N), a central temperate zone (between  $45^{\circ}$  and  $30^{\circ}$  N; typical of the Mediterranean Sea) and a southern warm zone ( $<30^{\circ}$  N). The main latitudinal ranges for the species were estimated by means of the median and interquartile range of the latitudinal component of the distributional data. Finally, the thermal affinity for each taxon was attributed based on whether its median fell in the cold, temperate or warm zone. In cases where the interquartile range was not fully included in the same zone as the median, an intermediate thermal affinity was attributed. Globally, six groups were defined: cold, cold-temperate (CT), temperate, temperate-warm (TW), warm and ubiquitous species. This classification was applied both for analysing the field samples catch composition, and for studying temporal trends in the reconstructed time series of landings. Differences among categories were analysed by using the Mann–Whitney U-test.

The time series (1970–2011) of the water temperature (annual mean) for the Venice Lagoon and the winter North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) have been reconstructed with respective values collected from local databases (see also www.istitutoveneto.it) and on the U.S. National Oceanographic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) climate prediction centre website (www.cpc.ncep.noaa.gov). The presence of regime shifts in the time series has been detected by applying the sequential *t*-test analysis of regime shift (STARS) developed by Rodionov (2004, 2005), based on a sequential *t*-test analysis. Temporal trends have been analysed by plotting annual landings for each target species against both water temperature and NAO. The same procedure was applied to landing data aggregated on the basis of the species thermal affinity.

Statistical significance of correlations was tested through the application of generalized additive models (GAM; Hastie & Tibshirani, 1990). GAM represents a semi-parametric regression technique for exploring relationships between response and predictor variables, having greater flexibility for drawing out the long-term non-linear trends than chain or linear modelling methods. Some predictors can be modelled non-parametrically, using a smoothing function, in addition to linear and polynomial terms, allowing the response shape to be fully determined by the data.

The following additive formulation was used:  $Y = a + s_1(V_1) + ... - s_n(V_n) + \varepsilon$ , where *a* is the intercept, *s* the thin plate smoothing spline function (Wood, 2003),  $V ... V_n$  the predictors and  $\varepsilon$  the random error. Model fitting and testing were carried out using the MGCV package (Wood, 2006), in R 2.13 (R Core Development team; www.r-project.org).

#### RESULTS

# FIELD SAMPLING ACTIVITY

The complete list of sampled species is given in Table I. In terms of biomass contribution, target species (11 taxa) accounted for c. 80% of total catches, incidental catches (11 taxa) for 19% and discarded species (33 taxa) for c. 2%

Scientific name	Common name	Ecological guild	Fishery category	Climatic affinity
Alosa fallax Anguilla anguilla Aphanius fasciatus	Twaite shad European eel Mediterranean killifish	Anadromous Catadromous Estuarine	Discard Target Discard	Cold Cold Temperate
Atherina boyeri Belone belone Boops boops Carcinus aestuarii Chelidonichthys lucerna	Sand smelt Garfish Bogue Green crab Tub gurnard	Estuarine Marine migrant Marine straggler Estuarine Marine migrant	Target Discard Discard Target Discard	Temperate Cold-temperate Temperate-warm Temperate Ubiquitous
Chelon labrosus Conger conger Crangon crangon Dicentrarchus labrax	Thicklip gray mullet Conger eel Brown shrimp European sea bass	Marine migrant Marine straggler Marine migrant Marine migrant	Incidental Discard Target Incidental	Cold-temperate Cold Cold Cold
Diplodus annularis	Annular seabream	Marine migrant	Discard	Temperate
Diplodus puntazzo Diplodus sargus Diplodus vulgaris Engraulis encrasicolous	Sharpsnout seabream White seabream Two-banded seabream European anchovy	Marine straggler Marine straggler Marine straggler Marine migrant	Discard Discard Discard Discard	Temperate Temperate Temperate–warm
Gambusia holbrooki	Eastern mosquitofish	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate
Gobius cobitis Gobius niger Gobius paganellus	Giant goby Black goby Rock goby	Marine straggler Estuarine Estuarine	Incidental Incidental Incidental	Temperate Cold Cold
Hippocampus guttulatus	Long-snouted seahorse	Estuarine	Discard	Ubiquitous
Hippocampus hippocampus	Short-snouted seahorse	Estuarine	Discard	Cold-temperate
Knipowitschia panizzae	Adriatic dwarf goby	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate
Lithognathus	Sand steenbras	Marine migrant	Incidental	Temperate
Liza aurata Liza ramada Liza saliens Mullus surmuletus Palaemon spp. Parablennius	Golden grey mullet Thinlip grey mullet Leaping mullet Surmullet Rockpool prawn Rusty blenny	Marine migrant Catadromous Marine migrant Marine migrant Estuarine Marine straggler	Target Incidental Incidental Incidental Target Discard	Temperate Cold-temperate Temperate Cold-temperate Cold Temperate
Penaeus spp. Platichthys flesus	Shrimp European flounder	Marine migrant Marine migrant	Incidental Target	Temperate Cold

TABLE I. List of taxa recorded from the Venice Lagoon

Scientific name	Common name	Ecological guild	Fishery category	Climatic affinity	
Pomatomus saltatrix	Bluefish	Marine straggler	Discard	Temperate-warm	
Pomatoschistus canestrinii	Canestrini's goby	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate	
Pomatoschistus marmoratus	Marbled goby	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate	
Pomatoschistus minutus	Sand goby	Marine migrant	Target	Cold	
Salaria pavo	Peacock blenny	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate	
Salmo trutta	Brown trout	Fresh water	Discard	Cold	
Sardina pilchardus	European pilchard	Marine migrant	Discard	Temperate	
Sepia officinalis	Common cuttlefish	Marine migrant	Target	Cold	
Sepiola rondeletii	Dwarf bobtail squid	Marine straggler	Discard	Temperate	
Solea solea	Common sole	Marine migrant	Incidental	Cold	
Sparus aurata	Gilthead seabream	Marine migrant	Target	Temperate	
Sprattus sprattus	Sprat	Marine migrant	Discard	Cold	
Symphodus cinereus	Gray wrasse	Marine straggler	Discard	Temperate	
Symphodus doderleini	Doderlein's wrasse	Marine straggler	Discard	Temperate	
Symphodus roissali	Five-spotted wrasse	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate	
Syngnathus abaster	Black-striped pipefish	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate	
Syngnathus acus	Greater pipefish	Marine migrant	Discard	Cold	
Syngnathus tenuirostris	Narrow-snouted pipefish	Estuarine	Discard	Temperate	
Syngnathus typhle	Broadnosed pipefish	Estuarine	Discard	Cold	
Trachurus trachurus	Atlantic horse mackerel	Marine straggler	Discard	Temperate	
Umbrina cirrosa	Shi drum	Marine migrant	Discard	Warm	
Zosterisessor ophiocephalus	Grass goby	Estuarine	Target	Temperate	

TABLE I. continued

[Fig. 2(a)]. For the ecological guilds [Fig. 2(b)], the observed pattern is related to the exploitation of a typical nektonic assemblage in a transitional water area. Estuarine and marine migrant species were well represented in the catches (18 and 21 species), accounting for 43 and 18% in biomass, and 12 species belonging to the marine stragglers category (<1% of total biomass). Finally, a moderate contribution to total catches came from the catadromous species group (37%), comprising only two species, [European eel *Anguilla anguilla* (L. 1758) and thinlip grey mullet *Liza ramada* (Risso 1827)] (see also Table I).

Data collected show some differences between the three basins, with significantly higher catches (Mann–Whitney U-test, P < 0.05) collected in the central part of



FIG. 2. Catch composition (in biomass, standardized data) in relation to (a) fishing activity and (b) ecological guilds from the Venice Lagoon.

the lagoon [Fig. 3(a)]. There is also a clear seasonality of catches, with significantly (Mann–Whitney *U*-test, P < 0.05) higher values recorded in autumn [Fig. 3(b)].

In relation to thermal affinity groups, data collected show that in terms of target species, catches are entirely composed of cold and temperate species (28 and 72%); whereas incidental catches and discard species are more heterogeneous. Temporal analysis of thermal affinity groups showed an oscillating pattern with a negative peak recorded in 2003 (statistically significant in comparison with both 2009 and 2010, Mann–Whitney *U*-test, P < 0.05). This represented the warmest year of the time series, being characterized by a heat wave during the summer (Fig. 4).

# TIME SERIES ANALYSIS

In order to analyse long-term variations and possible relationships with climate parameters, starting from the target species list, the time series of landings from 1945 to 2011 has been reconstructed with fish market data (Fig. 5). Different phases are recognizable: a sharp increasing trend between the 1950s and 1960s, culminating at the beginning of 1970s, then a declining trend with the minimum value recorded in 1999, followed by a slight recovery. The presence of different phases was also confirmed by the application of the STARs (Fig. 5). Given the temperature time series (1970–2011), a significant change of regime recorded in the second half of 1980s was clearly visible in terms of anomalies (Fig. 6); thus, the attention has been focused on the transition recorded in the second half of the 1980s. For almost all series, total catches and the 12 target species highlight a significant decrease in values during this period (Table II).

In terms of thermal affinity, a decreasing trend of both temperate and cold species abundance has been detected, more pronounced for the latter [Fig. 7(a)].

Possible correlations between landings and climate variables were investigated by contrasting different groups and species v. water temperature and the NAO index. Both cold and temperate groups showed a significant (tested with GAM) negative correlation with the water temperature [Fig. 7(a)]; this was confirmed by all the target species with the exception of gilthead seabream *Sparus aurata* L. 1758 and golden grey mullet *Liza aurata* (Risso 1810) for which a positive and



FIG. 3. Mean  $\pm$  s.E. catch values for (a) different areas within the Venice Lagoon and (b) season.

no relationship were detected [Fig. 7(b)]. The analysis contrasting landings v. the NAO index highlighted no significant correlation.

# DISCUSSION

Small-scale fisheries worldwide are recognized for their substantial contributions towards fish production and to be very relevant for their social, economic and ecological implications. Moreover, as underpinned also by the code of conduct for responsible fisheries (FAO, 1995), small-scale fisheries could represent, at least in some areas, a valid alternative to industrial fishery in terms of sustainable exploitation.



FIG. 4. Temporal variations of the thermal affinity groups represented in (a) the target species [■, cold; ■, temperate; \_\_\_\_\_, sea surface temperature (SST) anomaly] and (b) in the total catch (■, cold; ⊠, cold and temperate; □, temperate; □, temperate and warm; □, warm; □, ubiquitous; \_\_\_\_\_, SST anomaly) during the sampling periods within the Venice Lagoon. Catch values are means ± s.E.

According to the results obtained, the artisanal fishery in the Venice Lagoon is configured as a small-scale fishery, characterized by a large variety of target species and a marked seasonality.

The total catch composition, characterized by a high number of taxa, completely reflects the nektonic assemblage described in the lagoon environment (Malavasi *et al.*, 2004; Franco *et al.*, 2006), being composed of all the main ecological guilds typical of transitional waters. Targeted species represent the most abundant and regularly present groups in the lagoon, including resident species (estuarine), marine migrants and catadromous species. The marine stragglers by comparison, due to their random presence in the catches, are considered to be incidental or discard by local fishermen.

In relation to the economic classification of catches, the artisanal fishery is a low discard incidence activity (<2% in biomass), as described for other small-scale Mediterranean fisheries (Kelleher, 2005; Matić-Skoko *et al.*, 2011). The fishery also shows a strong seasonality, both in terms of total catch and catch composition,



FIG. 5. Temporal trend in landings of artisanal fishery target species from the Chioggia fish market (\_\_\_\_); different phases detected by the sequential *t*-test analysis of regime shift (STARS) are also reported (\_\_\_\_).

confirming the ability of fishermen to change their habits according to the different environmental and ecological conditions in order to optimize catch and maximize profitability (Colloca *et al.*, 2004; Tzanatos *et al.*, 2005; García-Rodríguez *et al.*, 2006; Battaglia *et al.*, 2010). The fishing activity in the lagoon is strongly related to habitat distribution (which, for example, can explain the spatial differences of catches in terms of different habitat configurations of fishing grounds), tidal currents and seasonal cycles. All of this directly requires the ecological knowledge of fishermen (in relation to life cycles of species, migrations, seasonality, feeding habits, influence of environmental factors such as tidal currents, morphology, salinity and temperature). Together with high cultural and heritage value (Matić-Skoko *et al.*, 2011), this knowledge represents an important source of diversity that has to be conserved (Silvano & Valbo-Jørgensen, 2008; Eddy *et al.*, 2010).

The combination of field and fish-market data, allowed the time series of landings of species targeted by artisanal fishery in the lagoon, from 1945 to today to be reconstructed. The time series analysis highlighted the presence of different phases that can be roughly summed up in an initial increasing phase, a stable period in the central part, and finally a long decreasing trend in landings.

All of the recognizable different phases are in accordance with those described by Libralato *et al.* (2004), and are explainable in terms of: (1) increasing fishing effort, both in relation to the number of vessels and diffusion of engine-powered boats, and increasing ecosystem carrying capacity owing to the first effects of the eutrophication during the first expansion, (2) the reaching of the carrying capacity in the stable phase and (3) finally, synergic effects of different causes (*e.g.* anoxia events, dystrophic crises and explosion of the mechanical clam harvesting) in the decline recorded since the 1980s (Libralato *et al.*, 2004).

Within the context of describing possible effects of climate changes, attention was focused on the regime shift in total catches in the mid-1980s. Defined by deYoung *et al.* (2008) this shift is as an extensive and relatively abrupt change, happening





© 2013 The Authors Journal of Fish Biology © 2013 The Fisheries Society of the British Isles, Journal of Fish Biology 2013, 83, 847-864

Year	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988
Anguilla anguilla		$\downarrow$			
Crangon crangon				$\downarrow$	
Platichtys flesus	$\downarrow$				
Pomatoschistus minutus	·		$\downarrow$		
Palaemon spp.		$\downarrow$	•		
Sepia officinalis	$\downarrow$	·			
Atherina boyeri	·		$\downarrow$		
Carcinus aestuarii (f.e.)			·	Ť	
Carcinus aestuarii (mo.)				¥	$\downarrow$
Liza aurata					•
Sparus aurata					
Zosterisessor ophiocephalus	Ţ				
Total catches	$\downarrow$				

TABLE II. Significant regime shift detected in the second half of 1980s; downward arrow indicates decreasing trend from that year forward

Carcinus aestuarii (f.e.), female with eggs; Carcinus aestuarii (mo.), specimens during the moulting phase.

within a few years, between contrasting persistent states of a system. It seemed to be related with changes in the thermal regime of the lagoon and with a regime shift (increasing variation) of the sea water temperature (SST) recorded both in 1984 and 1988. The presence of a negative shift in this period is confirmed by almost every target species. This was in agreement with other work from different areas in the Mediterranean Sea, showing a regime shift detected both in environmental (*i.e.* SST) and biological variables (Oguz & Gilbert, 2007; Conversi *et al.*, 2010; Matić *et al.*, 2011). In the same period (late 1980s) abrupt changes have also been recorded in different Atlantic areas, such as the North Sea, Baltic Sea and Wadden Sea with a positive correlation both with water temperature and the NAO index, confirming a climate driver (Alheit *et al.*, 2005; Weijerman *et al.*, 2005). This further confirms the presence of strong relationships (*via* teleconnection) between the Atlantic and Mediterranean Sea climate (Lionello & Galati, 2008; Querenda *et al.*, 2011).

In relation to thermal affinity of species, target catches, both in field and landings data, were almost entirely composed of cold and temperate species, with the temperate group largely dominating. It is interesting to note that among the target species, brown shrimp *Crangon crangon* and European flounder *Platichthys flesus* (L. 1758) can be considered Atlantic relicts of the Mediterranean Sea basin (Borsa *et al.*, 1997; Campos *et al.*, 2012), being distributed only in the coldest part (with boreal features), such as the northern Adriatic Sea. The time series analysis reveals a decreasing trend for both these groups and a significant inverse correlation with water temperature during recent decades. The same pattern has been detected for most target species, with the exception of *S. aurata*. These patterns can be explained by the effects of climate change on fish phenology, specific to recurrent temperature-dependent events, such as reproduction and migration, which can ultimately affect recruitment. Evidence of these effects is growing in the available literature, especially in terms of earlier

858



FIG. 7. Relationship between landings in terms of (a) thermal affinity groups in target species and (b) each target species and sea surface water temperature (SST) [*Carcinus aestuarii* (f.e.), female with eggs; *Carcinus aestuarii* (mo.), specimens during the moulting phase]. Curves fitted by locally weighted scatter-plot smoothing (LOESS).

breeding seasons, shift in migration dates, earlier larval appearance as a response to warming in commercially important freshwater and marine fishes (Gillet & Quetin, 2006; Pilling *et al.*, 2007; Taylor, 2008; Genner *et al.*, 2010). Similar results have been recently shown for a resident estuarine fish in the Venice Lagoon, the grass goby *Zosterisessor ophiocephalus* (Pallas 1814) (Zucchetta *et al.*, 2012). This work indicated that reproductive investment was positively correlated to temperature anomalies with breeding peaks occurring earlier in warmer years. This evidence suggests that temperature anomalies may determine a certain degree of mismatching between reproduction and food availability for larval and juvenile phases with possible negative impacts on recruitment. Accordingly, this may result in the negative trends observed by the present work.

The situation of *P. flesus* is heterogeneous. For areas located in the upper part of its range, a positive relationship with water temperature has been described (Genner *et al.*, 2004). Conversely, in proximity to the lower limits of distribution, negative effects of increasing temperature have been detected (Cabral *et al.*, 2001; Genner *et al.*, 2004; Vinagre *et al.*, 2009).

*Sparus aurata* is probably the warmest among the temperate species considered here and this could partially explain the recorded pattern. This species has experienced a large northward expansion in different places, in relation to water temperature increase (Cabral *et al.*, 2001; Coscia *et al.*, 2012).

No significant correlations have been detected between species or groups and the NAO index. This is in contrast with findings by Conversi *et al.* (2010). They reported a significant influence of this index on the biological regime shifts recorded in some Mediterranean Sea areas such as the Gulf of Lion and Adriatic Sea. This discrepancy could be explained by the fact that, at present, evidence of NAO effects on Mediterranean meteorological and ecological conditions are weak and lack convergence (Lionello & Galati, 2008; Vicente-Serrano & Trigo, 2011). Additionally, as the NAO effects are mainly mediated by river discharges (Struglia *et al.*, 2004), no real effects could be detected in the lagoon due to the river's diversion over past centuries in order to counteract the filling in of the basin.

Globally, results obtained seem to confirm the hypothesis that the northern Adriatic Sea area represents a kind of refugium for cold species, but also highlight the vulnerability of this nektonic assemblage to climate change. Since the Mediterranean surface waters are expected to warm by an average of  $3.1^{\circ}$  C by the end of the 21st century (Somot et al., 2006), a general northward shift of fish ranges is expected, leading to the gradual replacement of cold and temperate species by thermophilic ones. In this process, semi-enclosed areas such as the Adriatic Sea and, inside it, the Venice Lagoon, might act as reservoirs, but may also become a cul-de-sac for species that simply cannot further migrate (Ben Rais Lasram et al., 2010). From a fishery perspective, however, this change in the nektonic assemblage composition, with species substitution, may not be so deleterious, as fishermen usually can react very quickly to changes in resource exploitation. This was recently demonstrated in the Venice Lagoon with the Manila clam introduction and the following development of a fishing activity, producing  $>40\ 000\ t$  per year in less than a decade (Pranovi et al., 2004). This substitution, however, could be partially blocked by habitat fragmentation (Ben Rais Lasram et al., 2010); lagoons, for example, are patchily distributed within the Mediterranean Sea basin and so migrations of estuarine species among them could be slow or almost impossible due to the presence of inhospitable areas.

In conclusion, in spite of the fact that northward shifts of thermophilic species are largely demonstrated in the Adriatic Sea (Dulčić & Grbec, 2000; Dulčić *et al.*, 2010, 2011), their presence in the lagoon has not been detected, which is possibly a sign of good resilience of the assemblage. A clear decreasing trend of both cold and temperate species, however, has been recorded, and a

possible synergic effect of the increasing water temperature detected. All this highlights the vulnerability of artisanal fishery in the Venice Lagoon to climate change.

This study has been partially funded by Corila (Consorzio Ricerche Lagunari), by Magistrato alle Acque di Venezia and by Italian Ministry of Universities and Research (PRIN grants 2009 W2395). We would like to thank E. Coraci for help during first phases of analyses, K. Smyth and B. Smith for linguistic revisions of the manuscript.

# References

- AdriaMed, (2005). Adriatic Sea small-scale fisheries. Report of the AdriaMed Technical Consultation on Adriatic Sea Small-Scale Fisheries. Split, Croatia, 14th–15th October 2003. FAO-MiPAF Scientific Cooperation to Support Responsible Fisheries in the Adriatic Sea. GCP/RER/010/ITA/TD15. *AdriaMed Technical Documents* 15.
- Alheit, J., Möllmann, C., Dutz, J., Kornilovs, G., Loewe, P, Mohrholza, V. & Wasmunda, N. (2005). Synchronous ecological regime shifts in the central Baltic and the North Sea in the late 1980s. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 62, 1205–1215.
- Battaglia, P., Romeo, T., Consoli, P., Scotti, G. & Andaloro, F. (2010). Characterization of the artisanal fishery and its socio-economic aspects in the central Mediterranean Sea (Aeolian Islands, Italy). *Fisheries Research* 102, 87–97.
- Ben Rais Lasram, F. & Mouillot, D. (2009). Increasing southern invasion enhances congruence between endemic and exotic Mediterranean fish fauna. *Biological Invasions* 11, 97–711.
- Ben Rais Lasram, F., Guilhaumon, F., Albouy, C., Somotz, S., Thuiller, W. & Mouillot, D. (2010). The Mediterranean Sea as a 'cul-de-sac' for endemic fishes facing climate change. *Global Change Biology* 16, 3233–3245.
- Borsa, P., Blanquer, A. & Berrebi, P. (1997). Genetic structure of the flounders *Platichthys* flesus and *P. stellatus* at different geographic scales. *Marine Biology* **129**, 233–246.
- Brander, K. (2007). Global fish production and climate change. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* **104**, 19709–19714.
- Brander, K. (2010). Impacts of climate change on fisheries. *Journal of Marine Systems* **79**, 389–402.
- Cabral, H. N., Costa, M. J. & Salgado, J. P. (2001). Does the Tagus estuary fish community reflect environmental changes? *Climate Research* **18**, 119–126.
- Campos, J., Moreira, C., Freitas, F. & van der Veer, H. W. (2012). Short review of the eco-geography of *Crangon. Journal of Crustacean Biology* 32, 159–169.
  Cheung, W. L., Lam, V. W. Y., Sarmiento, J. L., Kearney, K., Watson, R. & Pauly, D.
- Cheung, W. L., Lam, V. W. Y., Sarmiento, J. L., Kearney, K., Watson, R. & Pauly, D. (2009). Projecting global marine biodiversity impacts under climate change scenarios. *Fish and Fisheries* 10, 235–251.
- Colloca, F., Crespi, V., Cerasi, S. & Coppola, S. R. (2004). Structure and evolution of the artisanal fishery in a southern Italian coastal area. *Fishery Research* **69**, 359–369.
- Conversi, A., Fonda Umani, S., Peluso, T., Molinero, J. C., Santojanni, A. & Edwards, M. (2010). The Mediterranean Sea regime shift at the end of the 1980s, and Intriguing parallelisms with other European Basins. *PLoS One* 5, e10633. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0010633
- Coscia, I., Vogiatzi, E., Kotoulas, G., Tsigenopolous, C. S. & Mariani, S. (2012). Exploring neutral and adaptive processes in expanding populations of gilthead seabream, *Sparus aurata* L., in North-East Atlantic. *Heredity* **108**, 537–546.
- Cramer, W., Bondeau, A., Woodward, F. I., Prentice, I. C., Betts, R. A., Brovkin, V., Cox, P. M., Fisher, V., Foley, J. A., Friend, A. D., Kucharik, C., Lomas, M. R., Ramankutty, N., Sitch, S., Smith, B., White, A. & Young-Molling, C. (2001). Global response of terrestrial ecosystem structure and function to CO2 and climate change: results from six dynamic global vegetation models. *Global Change Biology* 7, 357–373.
- Drinkwater, K. F., Beaugrand, G., Kaeriyama, M., Kim, S., Ottersen, G., Perry, R. I., Pörtner, H. O., Polovina, J. J. & Takasuka, A. (2010). On the processes linking climate to ecosystem changes. *Journal of Marine Systems* **79**, 374–388.

- Dulčić, J. & Grbec, B. (2000). Climate changes and Adriatic ichthyofauna. Fishery Oceanography 9, 187–191.
- Dulčić, J., Pallaoro, A., Dragičević, B. & Stagličić-Radica, N. (2010). First record of dwarf flathead *Elates ransonnetii* (Platycepahlidae) in the Adriatic Sea. *Cybium* 34, 222–223.
- Dulčić, J., Dragičević, B., Grgičević, R. & Lipej, L. (2011). First substantiated record of Lessepsian migrant – the dusky spinefoot Siganus luridus (Actinopterygii: Perciformes: Siganidae) – in the Adriatic Sea. Acta Ichthyologica et Piscatoria 41, 141–143.
- Eddy, T. D., Gardner, J. P. A. & Pérez-Matus, A. (2010). Applying fishers' ecological knowledge to construct past and future lobster stocks in the Juan Fernandez Archipelago, Chile. *PLoS One* **5**, e13670. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0013670
- FAO (1995). Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries. FAO: Rome. Available at http://www.fao.org/docrep/005/v9878e/v9878e00.HTM
- Franco, A., Franzoi, P., Malavasi, S., Riccato, F. & Torricelli, P. (2006). Use of shallow water habitats by fish assemblages in a Mediterranean coastal lagoon. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 66, 67–83.
- García-Rodríguez, M., Fernández, Á. M. & Esteban, A. (2006). Characterisation, analysis and catch rates of the small-scale fisheries of the Alicante Gulf (SE Spain) over a 10 years time series. *Fisheries Research* **77**, 226–238.
- Genner, M. J., Sims, D. W., Wearmouth, V. J., Southall, E. J., Southward, A. J., Henderson, P. A. & Hawkins, S. J. (2004). Regional climatic warming drives long term community changes of British marine fish. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B* 271, 655–661.
- Genner, M. J., Haliday, N. C., Simpson, S. D., Southward, A. J., Hawkins, S. J. & Sims, D. W. (2010). Temperature-driven phenological changes within a marine larval fish assemblage. *Journal of Plankton Research* 32, 699–708.
- Gillet, C. & Quetin, P. (2006). Effect of temperature changes on the reproductive cycle of roach in Lake Geneva from 1983 to 2001. *Journal of Fish Biology* 69, 518–534.
- Granzotto, A., Franzoi, P., Longo, A., Pranovi, F. & Torricelli, P. (2001). La pesca nella Laguna di Venezia: un percorso di sostenibilità nel recupero delle tradizioni. Lo stato dell'arte. Rapporto sullo sviluppo sostenibile 2.2001. Venice: Fondazione Enrico Mattei.
- Granzotto, A., Libralato, S., Pranovi, F., Raicevich, S. & Giovanardi, O. (2004). Comparison between artisanal and industrial fisheries by using ecosystem indicators. *Chemistry and Ecology* 20, 435–449.
- Hastie, T. & Tibshirani, R. (1990). Generalized Additive Models. London: Chapman and Hall.
- Hiddink, J. G. & Hofstede, R. T. (2008). Climate induced increases in species richness of marine fishes. *Global Change Biology* 14, 453–460.
- Hughes, T. P., Baird, A. H., Bellwood, D. R., Card, M. Connolly, S. R., Folke, C., Grosberg, R., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Jackson, J. B. C., Kleypas, J., Lough, J. M., Marshall, P., Nystrom, M., Palumbi, S. R., Pandolfi, J.M., Rosen, B. & Roughgarden, J. (2003). Climate change, human impacts and the resilience of coral reefs. *Science* **301**, 929–933.
- Kelleher, K. (2005). Discards in the world's marine fisheries. An update. FAO Fisheries Technical Paper 470.
- Libralato, S., Pranovi, F., Torricelli, P., Raicevich, S., Da Ponte, F., Pastres, R. & Mainardi, D. (2004). Ecological stages of the Venice Lagoon analysed using landing time series data. *Journal of Marine Systems* 51, 331–344.
- Lionello, P. & Galati, M. B. (2008). Links of the significant wave height distribution in the Mediterranean Sea with the Northern Hemisphere teleconnection patterns. *Advances in Geoscience* 17, 13–18.
- Malavasi, S., Fiorin, R., Franco, A., Franzoi, P., Granzotto, A., Riccato, F. & Mainardi, D. (2004). Fish assemblages of Venice Lagoon shallow waters: an analysis based on species, families and functional guilds. *Journal of Marine Systems* 51, 19–31.
- Marcello, A. (1960). Lacuna floristica del veneziano e sue condizioni bioclimatiche. *Memorie Biogeografiche Adriatiche* 5, 51–118.
- Matić, F., Grbec, B. & Morović, M. (2011). Indications of climate regime shifts in the middle Adriatic Sea. *Acta Adriatica* **52**, 235–246.
- Matić-Skoko, S., Stagličić, N., Pallaoro, A., Kraljević, M., Dulčić, J., Tutman, P. & Dragičević, B. (2011). Effectiveness of conventional management in Mediterranean type artisanal fisheries. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* **91**, 314–324.

- Mills, M. D., Rader, R. B. & Belk, M. C. (2004). Complex interactions between native and invasive fish: the simultaneous effects of multiple negative interactions. *Oecologia* 141, 713–721.
- Oguz, T. & Gilbert, D. (2007). Abrupt transitions of the top-down controlled Black Sea pelagic ecosystem during 1960–2000: evidence for regime-shifts under strong fishery exploitation and nutrient enrichment modulated by climate induced variations. *Deep-Sea Research I: Oceanographic Research Papers* **54**, 220–242.
- Parmesan, C. (2006). Ecological and evolutionary responses to recent climate change. Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics 37, 637–669.
- Parmesan, C. & Yohe, G. (2003). A globally coherent fingerprint of climate change impacts across natural systems. *Nature* 421, 37–42.
- Pilling, G. M., Millner, R. S., Easey, M. W., Maxwell, D. L. & Tidd, A. N. (2007). Phenology and North Sea cod *Gadus morhua* L.: has climate change affected otolith annulus formation and growth? *Journal of Fish Biology* **70**, 584–599.
- Pranovi, F., Libralato, S., Raicevich, S., Granzotto, A., Pastres, R. & Giovanardi, O. (2003). Mechanical clam dredging in Venice Lagoon: effects on ecosystem stability evaluated with a trophic mass-balance model. *Marine Biology* 143, 393–403.
- Pranovi, F., Da Ponte, F., Raicevich, S. & Giovanardi, O. (2004). A multidisciplinary study of the immediate effects of mechanical clam-harvesting in the Venice Lagoon. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 61, 43–52.
- Pranovi, F., Franceschini, G., Casale, M., Zucchetta, M., Giovanardi, O. & Torricelli, P. (2006). An ecological imbalance induced by a non-native species: the Manila clam in the Venice Lagoon. *Biological Invasions* 8, 595–609.
- Querenda, J., Montòn, E. & Escrig, J. (2011). Teleconnections between the North Atlantic SST and Mediterranean rainfall. *Tethys* 8, 31–42.
- Rodionov, S. N. (2004). A sequential algorithm for testing climate regime shifts. *Geophysical Research Letters* 31, L09204. doi: 10.1029/2004GL019448
- Rodionov, S. N. (2005). A brief overview of the regime shift detection methods. In Large-Scale Disturbances (Regime Shifts) and Recovery in Aquatic Ecosystems: Challenges for Management Toward Sustainability, UNESCO-ROSTE/BAS Workshop on Regime Shifts (Velikova, V. & Chipev, N., eds), pp. 17–24. Varna: UNESCO.
- Rosenzweig, C., Karoly, D., Vicarelli, M. Neofotis, P., Wu, Q., Casassa, G., Menzel, A., Root, T. L., Estrella, N., Seguin, B., Tryjanowski, P., Liu, C., Rawlins, S. & Imeson, A. (2008). Attributing physical and biological impacts to anthropogenic climate change. *Nature* 453, 353–357.
- Sacchi, C. F. (1978). Il delta del Po come elemento disgiuntore nell'ecologia delle spiaggie adriatiche – Considerazioni generali e conferme malacofaunistiche. *Bollettino del Museo Civico di Storia Naturale di Venezia* 29, 43–73.
- Silvano, R. A. M. & Valbo-Jørgensen, J. (2008). Beyond fishermen's tales: contributions of fishers' local ecological knowledge to fish ecology and fisheries management. *Envi*ronment, Development and Sustainability 10, 657–675.
- Somot, S., Sevault, F. & Déqué, M. (2006). Transient climate change scenario simulation of the Mediterranean Sea for the twenty-first century using a high-resolution ocean circulation model. *Climate Dynamics* **27**, 851–879.
- Struglia, M. V., Mariotti, A. & Filograsso, A. (2004). River discharge into the Mediterranean Sea: climatology and aspects of the observed variability. *Journal of Climate* 17, 4740–4751.
- Taylor, S. G. (2008). Climate warming causes phonological shift in Pink Salmon, Oncorhynchus gorbusca, behaviour at Auke Creek, Alaska. Global Change Biology 14, 229–235.
- Thomas, C. D., Bodsworth, E. J., Wilson, R. J., Simmons, A. D., Davies, Z. G., Musche, M. & Conradt, L. (2001). Ecological and evolutionary processes at expanding range margins. *Nature* 411, 577–581.
- Tzanatos, E., Dimitriou, E., Katselis, G., Georgiadis, M. & Koutsikopoulos, C. (2005). Composition, temporal dynamics and regional characteristics of small-scale fisheries in Greece. *Fishery Research* 73, 147–158.

- Vicente-Serrano, S. M. & Trigo, R. M. (Eds) (2011). Hydrological, Socioeconomic and Ecological Impacts of the North Atlantic Oscillation in the Mediterranean Region. Houten: Springer. doi: 10.1007/978-94-007-1372-7\_11, C\_ Springer Science+Business Media B.V
- Vinagre, C., Santos, F. D., Cabral, H. N. & Costa, M. J. (2009). Impact of climate and hydrology on juvenile fish recruitment towards estuarine nursery grounds in the context of climate changes. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 85, 479–486.
- Weijerman, M., Lindeboom, H. & Zuur, A. F. (2005). Regime shifts in marine ecosystems of the North Sea and Wadden Sea. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 298, 21–39.
- Wood, S. N. (2003). Thin-plate regression splines. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society B* **65**, 95–114.
- Wood, S. N. (2006). *Generalized Additive Models: An Introduction with R*. Boca Raton, FL: Chapman & Hall/CRC.
- deYoung, B., Barange, M., Beaugrand, G., Harris, R., Perry, R. I., Scheffer, M. & Werner, F. (2008). Regime shifts in marine ecosystems: detection, prediction and management. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution* 23, 402–409.
- Zucchetta, M., Cipolato, G., Pranovi, F., Antonetti, P., Torricelli, P., Franzoi, P. & Malavasi, S. (2012). The relationships between temperature changes and reproductive investment in a brackish fish: insights for the assessment of climate change effects. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 101, 15–23.